

APRIL 30, 2012

A special meeting of the Board of Trustees of the Village of Lakewood, NY, was held Monday, April 30, 2012 at 6:30 PM, with Mayor David T. Wordelmann presiding. Trustees present were Gale A. Denn, Susan F. Drago, Joseph M. Troche and John Jablonski III. Also present were Village Clerk Joseph M. Johnson, Village Treasurer Andrea J. Windoft, Village Attorney Edward P. Wright and Building Inspector Charles L. Smith.

MAYOR'S REPORT

Mayor David T. Wordelmann thanked those present for attending tonight's special meeting, adding he wished that this many residents would have showed-up for the public hearing on the village budget. Mayor Wordelmann then explained to the residents in attendance how he and members of the Board of Trustees got to where they are in the budget process. For the past six or seven years the contract to collect household garbage and recyclables cost the Village of Lakewood approximately \$ 105,000.00 annually. After speaking with Mr. John Penhollow, President of Penhollow Disposal Service prior to requesting bids it was understood that due to many factors the price of collecting and disposing household garbage and recyclables was going to increase substantially. This year the bids were requested in the month of January so he and the Board of Trustees would know how much to budget. When the bids came in higher than expected, (approximately \$ 53,000.00 increase), it was decided to reject the bids received on February 23, 2012 and re-bid, but with altered bid specifications. By altering the bid specifications and looking at various options to collect/manage recyclables, the Board of Trustees was hopeful that the second wave of bids would be lower in cost. Mayor Wordelmann said one option regarding recyclables was to consider single stream recycling wherein residents would put all of their recyclables into a single container for pick-up. Long story short, the bids came back with the low bid of \$112,000.00, that didn't include recycling and the low bid of \$ 135,000.00 which included recycling. One specification change was to have the contractor pick-up household garbage throughout the Village of Lakewood on a single day of the week as a means to reduce the contractor's overhead. Mayor Wordelmann indicated that he was the main proponent to change how recyclables were to be managed as another means to reduce the price to the tune of about \$ 20,000.00. Across the country school boards and municipal boards are searching for ways to save money because quite frankly people are tired of increases in their property taxes. For the village level of government every tax dollar collected is spent to provide a particular service. In order to lower taxes, services must be altered or eliminated. Mayor Wordelmann said his idea to eliminate curb-side pick-up of recyclables and set-up a recycling center, saving \$20,000.00, was not well received by the residents. Mayor Wordelmann admitted he was wrong, however he doesn't believe an alternative method of how recyclables are managed isn't as big a deal as some residents are making it out to be. Mayor Wordelmann noted many local communities have set-up their own recycling centers for their residents. It wasn't as if the Village of Lakewood was proposing something outlandish. Mayor Wordelmann would like to recommend that the Board of Trustees consider rescinding the Resolution #15-2012-2013, adopted last Monday and to adopt a resolution accepting a secondary bid as submitted by Penhollow Disposal Service, Sinclairville, N.Y.

Mayor Wordelmann then introduced Mr. John Penhollow, President of Penhollow Disposal Service to those in attendance and asked him to briefly explain how his company will be managing the Village of Lakewood's household garbage and recyclables.

Mr. Penhollow indicated that he has enjoyed working as the Village of Lakewood's garbage contractor for the past nine years but he too is tired of ever increasing property taxes. In reducing the cost of the bid from \$ 165,000.00/year to \$ 135,000.00/year Mr. Penhollow said he is proposing to pick-up household garbage throughout the village one day a week, which will be Thursdays.

APRIL 30, 2012 (CONTINUED)

Mr. Penhollow then noted that recyclables will also be picked-up on Thursdays, with newspapers and cardboard picked-up the first Thursday of the month, plastic the second Thursday of the month and glass and tin the third Thursday of the month. Mr. Penhollow said no recyclables will be picked-up on the fourth Thursday of the month. Per the three year bid price of \$ 413,000.00, the annual cost for the collection and disposal of household garbage and recyclables averages out to be approximately \$137, 666.00/year. Mr. Penhollow said the new schedule will commence June 7th.

Mrs. Terry Turner, 105 East Terrace Ave., said she owns property in Ellicottville, N.Y., where single stream recycling is done. She asked why couldn't that form of recycling be done in Lakewood.

Mr. Penhollow said that was one of the bid options, however the schedule that he is proposing is what works best for him and his company. Mr. Penhollow said he is able to market the recyclables that are already sorted much easier. For larger contractors that provide single stream or zero sort recycling it costs money to haul and sort those same recyclables. Costs for that extra service are passed on to the taxpayer. Mr. Penhollow went on to say that costs associated with the operation of his business have increased considerably the past few years. With an escalated service comes escalated costs.

Ms. Nancy Bargar, 11 West Terrace Ave., indicated it is so important to encourage residents to recycle so as to remove waste from the garbage stream, which in turn will ultimately reduce costs in the bigger picture when it comes to adding cells to the county landfill. She noted that the city of Ann Arbor, MI successfully switched to single stream recycling a couple years ago and it is predicted that 80% of communities across America will be utilizing single stream recycling within the next four to five years. It is just a matter of time. Ms. Bargar said the Village of Lakewood should not be short sighted when discussing this important issue. As a former member of the Chautauqua County Legislature Ms. Bargar said she was on the Environmental Committee, where there was constant review and discussions on what kind of prices the various recyclables were getting. Ms. Bargar reminded everyone that it is a New York State Law that municipalities must provide a recycling program for its residents.

Mr. Penhollow reiterated that recyclables collected via single steam recycling are very difficult to market here in Western New York because there just isn't enough volume. The reason Penhollow Disposal Service is not proposing single stream recycling is because of the low volume and marketability of the recyclables collected. We could provide that service but the cost in doing so would increase significantly. Mr. Penhollow went on to say that he has offered solutions to the questions on how to reduce costs without changing the level of service or habits of the residential customers. Mr. Penhollow indicated the idea of establishing a recycling center is a move in the right direction as far as reducing costs and is something the Village of Lakewood should again consider in the future. He added single stream recycling isn't the answer to everything.

Ms. Barger interjected saying she would advocate change which is definitely needed when it comes to recycling.

Trustee Gale Denn said if the Village of Lakewood switched to single stream recycling he would have some concerns about the elderly of the community trying to haul a heavy large tote out to the curb on days recyclables are collected.

Mr. Geoffrey Bond, 20 East Lake Street, said he would be in favor of having a central drop-off point for recyclables because recyclables at his household pile-up quickly over a given month, especially if he is out of town on business or on vacation.

APRIL 30, 2012 (CONTINUED)

Mayor Wordelmann thanked Mr. Bond for his comment because that was one of the reasons he proposed the recycling center near the D.P.W. Garage on Packard Ave.

Ms. Barb Wendel, 11 Highland Ave., asked Mayor Wordelmann if the recycling center as proposed would have been monitored.

Mayor Wordelmann said the plan was to have three dumpsters at a fenced-in site off Packard Ave. He told Ms. Wendel the schedule as to when the facility would be open and monitored had not yet been finalized.

Mr. Penhollow asked those in attendance for a show of hands if they would like recycling to continue as it is and a show of hands from those residents willing to manage their own recyclables via a central recycling center.

Mr. Gerald Holmes, 10 Holly Dr., asked Mr. Penhollow if he knew what percentage of residents recycle.

Mr. Penhollow said he couldn't answer Mr. Holmes' question without first checking data on file in his office.

Mrs. Jane Gesing, 103 Lakeview Ave., told Mr. Penhollow that on occasion his employees dump recyclables directly into the truck for compaction.

Mr. Penhollow indicated to Mrs. Gesing if the recyclables are contaminated or if the item for recycling doesn't conform with the list of recyclable items listed on the front of the recycling calendar then the item is considered trash and must be taken to the landfill for disposal. He asked Mrs. Gesing to please call Penhollow Disposal Service or the Village Clerk's Office if she suspects any problems with how his employees are performing their duties.

Mrs. Kay Fugagli, 52 West Terrace Ave., said it is her opinion that less people would recycle if they were required to haul their recyclables to a special site.

Mrs. Marian Anderson, 115 West Terrace Ave., wished to thank Mr. Penhollow and his fellow employees for the wonderful job they do for the Village of Lakewood.

Mr. Penhollow said he appreciates the comments and reminded everyone that the same service the City of Jamestown provides to its residents at \$ 12.00/month per household, his company provides to the residents of the Village of Lakewood at just under \$ 8.00/month per household.

Mayor Wordelmann indicated he could see a difference in service when Penhollow Disposal Service took over several years ago. It was like night and day. The first thing he would hear from residents was, look how the garbage men put the lids back on their trash receptacles. Another example of excellent service provided by employees of Penhollow Disposal Service is when they assist the elderly with their garbage and/or recyclables. Mayor Wordelmann then thanked Mr. Penhollow for taking time this evening in taking questions and explaining the new schedule.

Trustee Gale Denn also wished to commend Penhollow Disposal Service's employees for the great job they do. He said the Board of Trustees took the position they did not only to save money but also to see if residents would be ready and willing to undertake recycling on their own. The idea wasn't to take a service away from residents rather seeing if residents would lend a hand in managing their recyclables.

APRIL 30, 2012 (CONTINUED)

Obviously what we learned was that once a quality service is provided, it is difficult to then take it away.

Ms. Barb Wendel, asked Mayor Wordelmann if this cost savings measure for residents to handle their own recyclables was switched because of a mere sixty phone calls.

Mayor Wordelmann indicated that residents have asked their elected officials to cut taxes, however when we introduced a new plan on handling their recyclables, there was a public outcry against the idea. Mayor Wordelmann said the village tax rate is actually lower per \$ 1,000.00 of assessed value then it was seven years ago.

Trustee Troche indicated that how we handle the collection of recyclables eventually will have to change, however it might not be the right thing to do at this time.

Mayor Wordelmann indicated that people are not used to change, but as Trustee Troche indicated the Village of Lakewood eventually will have to change how recyclables are handled and go to single stream recycling or establish its own recycling center.

Trustee John Jablonski indicated the Village of Lakewood should remind those residents who don't recycle that by law they are required to do so.

Trustee Susan Drago indicated to Ms. Wendel that she understands her position however the people spoke up concerning this particular issue and we listened.

RESOLUTION #27-2012-2013 – RESCIND RESOLUTION #15-2012-2013

Motion by Trustee Denn, seconded by Trustee Troche, for the Board of Trustee to rescind Resolution #15-2012-2013, adopted April 23, 2012, which approved the low bid of \$ 351,000.00 for the collection and disposal of household garbage and recyclables for a three year period commencing June 1, 2012, as submitted by Penhollow Disposal Service, Sinclairville, N.Y.

Adopted: 4 ayes, no nays (Denn, Drago, Jablonski, Troche)

RESOLUTION #28-2012-2013 – RESCIND RESOLUTION #9-2012-2013

Motion by Trustee Drago, seconded by Trustee Troche, for the Board of Trustees to rescind Resolution #9-2012-2013, adopted April 9, 2012, which approved the Tentative Budget for the fiscal year commencing June 1, 2012 and ending May 31, 2013.

Adopted: 4 ayes, no nays (Denn, Drago, Jablonski, Troche)

RESOLUTION #29-2012-2013 – ACCEPT GARBAGE COLLECTION/RECYCLING BID

Motion by Trustee Troche, seconded by Trustee Jablonski, per the recommendation of Mayor Wordelmann, for the Board of Trustees to accept the low bid of \$ 413,000.00, for the collection and disposal of household garbage and recyclables, as submitted by Penhollow Disposal Service, Sinclairville, N.Y., for a three year period commencing June 1, 2012.

Adopted: 4 ayes, no nays (Denn, Drago, Jablonski, Troche)

APRIL 30, 2012 (CONTINUED)

RESOLUTION #30-2012-2013 – ADOPT 2012-2013 VILLAGE BUDGET AS AMENDED

Motion by Trustee Troche, seconded by Trustee Drago, per the recommendation of Mayor Wordelmann for the Board of Trustees to adopt the Village of Lakewood's tentative budget as amended in the amount of \$ 3,142,216 for the fiscal year of June 1, 2012 – May 31, 2013, making appropriations for the conduct of Village government and establishing the rate of compensation for its elected officials, which will remain at the previous year's rates, {Mayor: \$ 7,500.00, Trustees: \$ 3,500.00};

WHEREAS, the Board of Trustees conducted a public hearing on the tentative budget at the time and place specified in the notice of public hearing and heard all persons desiring to be heard;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the tentative budget as presented and reviewed be hereby adopted.

NOTE: The newly adopted budget reflects a tax rate of \$ 7.302/1,000 assessed valuation which is an increase of \$.15/1,000 assessed valuation when compared with last year's budget.

Adopted: 4 ayes, no nays (Denn, Drago, Jablonski, Troche)

Motion by Trustee Troche, seconded by Trustee Drago, and unanimously carried, the Board adjourned at 7:29 PM.

Joseph M. Johnson
Village Clerk

